

Rights and Access form Completed form for your article [ATMOS_105032]

1 message

Elsevier - Author Forms <Article_Status@elsevier.com>
To: aryastanaputu@gmail.com

Fri, May 29, 2020 at 5:56 PM

ELSEVIER

Dear Mr Aryastana,

Thank you for publishing your article in Atmospheric Research . Professor. Liu completed the Rights and Access Form for your article *Assessment of satellite precipitation product estimates over Bali Island* on May 29, 2020.

The Order Summary is attached to this email. A copy of the Order Summary is also sent to all co-authors for whom we have contact details.

Your article will be free for everyone to read online within 24 hours at <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosres.2020.105032>

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact us. To help us assist you, please quote our article reference ATMOS_105032 in all correspondence.

Now that your article has been accepted, you will want to maximize the impact of your work. Elsevier facilitates and encourages authors to share their article responsibly. To learn about the many ways in which you can share your article whilst respecting copyright, visit: www.elsevier.com/sharing-articles.

Kind regards,
Elsevier Researcher Support

**Seven strategies for you to create a brand and promote your research**

Learn how to give your research the visibility it deserves with these seven strategies.

> [Access module now](#)

Have questions or need assistance?

Please do not reply to this automated message.

For further assistance, please visit our [Elsevier Support Center](#) where you search for solutions on a range of topics and find answers to frequently asked questions.

You can also talk to our researcher support team by phone 24 hours a day from Monday-Friday and 24/7 by live chat and email.

© 2018 Elsevier Ltd | [Privacy Policy](http://www.elsevier.com/privacypolicy) <http://www.elsevier.com/privacypolicy>

Elsevier Limited, The Boulevard, Langford Lane, Kidlington, Oxford, OX5 1GB, United Kingdom, Registration No. 1982084. This e-mail has been sent to you from Elsevier Ltd. To ensure delivery to your inbox (not bulk or junk folders), please add article_status@elsevier.com to your address book or safe senders list.

2 attachments

 **Order Confirmation.html**
13K

 **Terms and Conditions of Sale and Purchase.pdf**
139K

Share your article [ATMOS_105032] published in Atmospheric Research

1 message

Elsevier - Article Status <Article_Status@elsevier.com>
To: aryastanaputu@gmail.com

Sat, May 23, 2020 at 12:51 AM

ELSEVIER**Share your article!**

Dear Mr Aryastana,

As co-author of the article *Assessment of satellite precipitation product estimates over Bali Island*, we are pleased to let you know that the final version – containing full bibliographic details – is now available online.

To help you and the other authors access and share this work, we have created a Share Link – a personalized URL providing **50 days' free access** to the article. Anyone clicking on this link before July 11, 2020 will be taken directly to the final version of your article on ScienceDirect, which they are welcome to read or download. No sign up, registration or fees are required.



Your personalized Share Link:
<https://authors.elsevier.com/c/1b6Pfd3S8n8D>

Click on the icons below to share with your network:



We encourage you to use this Share Link to download a copy of the article for your own archive. The URL is also a quick and easy way to share your work with colleagues, co-authors and friends. And you are welcome to add the Share Link to your homepage or social media profiles, such as Facebook and Twitter.

You can find out more about Share Links on [Elsevier.com](https://www.elsevier.com).

Did you know, as an author, you can use your article for a wide range of scholarly, non-commercial purposes, and share and post your article online in a variety of ways? For more information visit www.elsevier.com/sharing-articles.

Kind regards,
Elsevier Researcher Support

Increase your article's impact

Our [Get Noticed](#) guide contains a range of practical tips and advice to help you maximize visibility of your article.

Publishing Lab

Do you have ideas on how we can improve the author experience? Sign up for the [Elsevier Publishing Lab](#) and help us develop our publishing innovations!

Have questions or need assistance?

Please do not reply to this automated message.

For further assistance, please visit our [Elsevier Support Center](#) where you search for solutions on a range of topics and find answers to frequently asked questions.

You can also talk to our researcher support team by phone 24 hours a day from Monday-Friday and 24/7 by live chat and email.

© 2018 Elsevier Ltd | Privacy Policy <http://www.elsevier.com/privacypolicy>

Elsevier Limited, The Boulevard, Langford Lane, Kidlington, Oxford, OX5 1GB, United Kingdom, Registration No. 1982084. This e-mail has been sent to you from Elsevier Ltd. To ensure delivery to your inbox (not bulk or junk folders), please add article_status@elsevier.com to your address book or safe senders list.

Sent to Production: New status for your co-authored submission to Atmospheric Research

1 message

Atmospheric Research <Evisesupport@elsevier.com>

Fri, May 8, 2020 at 5:41 PM

Reply-To: Evisesupport@elsevier.com

To: aryastanaputu@gmail.com

Dear Mr Aryastana,

You have been listed as a co-author of the following submission:

Submission no: ATMOSRES_2020_55_R1

Submission title: Assessment of Satellite Precipitation Product Estimates over Bali Island

Corresponding author: Professor Chian-Yi Liu

Listed co-author(s): Mr Putu Aryastana, Dr Gin-Rong Liu, Dr Wan-Ru Huang

We are writing to let you know the status of this submission has changed to Sent to Production. The link below takes you to a webpage where you can log in to our submission system using your existing Elsevier profile credentials or register to create a new profile. You will then have the opportunity to view the submission status and see reviewer and editor comments once they become available.

http://www.evisesupport.com/profile/api/navigate/ATMOSRES?resourceUrl=%2Fco-author%2F%3Fdgcid%3Dinvite_email_coauthorupdate01698095%23%2FATMOSRES%2Fsubmission%2FATMOSRES_2020_55&email=aryastanaputu@gmail.com&firstName=Putu&surname=Aryastana&country=Taiwan&institution=National+Central+University&title=Mr

If you are not a co-author of this manuscript, please contact Researcher Support at: <https://service.elsevier.com>

Once again, thank you very much for your submission.

Atmospheric Research

If you do not wish to receive further update emails on your co-authored submission, you can unsubscribe via this link:

http://www.evisesupport.com/co-author/#/ATMOSRES/unsubscribe/aryastanaputu@gmail.com/kJfAJz-ZzRSOZA_jwWeomBcbmqeFEQd5wAhUA2DqRxYId2rgjl1Hyqr3gizMS0k2xOuwpAGr3_zU_siTiseeHA

Your co-authored submission

1 message

Atmospheric Research <Evisesupport@elsevier.com>

Sun, Apr 5, 2020 at 5:05 PM

Reply-To: system@evise.com

To: aryastanaputu@gmail.com

Dear Mr. Aryastana,

You have been listed as a Co-Author of the following submission:

Journal: Atmospheric Research

Title: Assessment of Satellite Precipitation Product Estimates over Bali Island

Corresponding Author: Chian-Yi Liu

Co-Authors: Putu Aryastana, Gin-Rong Liu, Wan-Ru Huang

Chian-Yi Liu submitted this manuscript via Elsevier's online submission system, EVISE®. If you are not already registered in EVISE®, please take a moment to set up an author account by navigating to http://www.evise.com/evise/faces/pages/navigation/NavController.jspx?JRNL_ACR=ATMOSRES

If you already have an ORCID, we invite you to link it to this submission. If the submission is accepted, your ORCID will be transferred to ScienceDirect and CrossRef and published with the manuscript.

To link an existing ORCID to this submission, or sign up for an ORCID if you do not already have one, please click the following link: [Link ORCID](#)

What is ORCID?

ORCID is an open, non-profit, community-based effort to create and maintain a registry of unique researcher identifiers and a transparent method of linking research activities and outputs to these identifiers.

More information on ORCID can be found on the ORCID website, <http://www.ORCID.org>, or on our ORCID help page: http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/2210/p/7923

If you did not co-author this submission, please contact the Corresponding Author directly at cyliau@csrsr.ncu.edu.tw.

Thank you,
Atmospheric Research

This message was sent automatically. Please do not reply

Revision Requested: New status for your co-authored submission to Atmospheric Research

1 message

Atmospheric Research <EvisSupport@elsevier.com>

Thu, Mar 26, 2020 at 6:06 PM

Reply-To: EvisSupport@elsevier.com

To: aryastanaputu@gmail.com

Dear Mr Aryastana,

You have been listed as a co-author of the following submission:

Submission no: ATMOSRES_2020_55

Submission title: Assessment of Satellite Precipitation Product Estimates over Bali Island

Corresponding author: Professor Chian-Yi Liu

Listed co-author(s): Mr Putu Aryastana, Dr Gin-Rong Liu, Dr Wan-Ru Huang

We are writing to let you know the status of this submission has changed to Revision Requested. The link below takes you to a webpage where you can log in to our submission system using your existing Elsevier profile credentials or register to create a new profile. You will then have the opportunity to view the submission status and see reviewer and editor comments once they become available.

http://www.evis.com/profile/api/navigate/ATMOSRES?resourceUrl=%2Fco-author%2F%3Fdgcid%3Dinvite_email_coauthorupdate01698095%23%2FATMOSRES%2Fsubmission%2FATMOSRES_2020_55&email=aryastanaputu@gmail.com&firstName=Putu&surname=Aryastana&country=Taiwan&institution=National+Central+University&title=Mr

If you are not a co-author of this manuscript, please contact Researcher Support at: <https://service.elsevier.com>

Once again, thank you very much for your submission.

Atmospheric Research

If you do not wish to receive further update emails on your co-authored submission, you can unsubscribe via this link:

http://www.evis.com/co-author/#/ATMOSRES/unsubscribe/aryastanaputu@gmail.com/Ca6v5AEpIWkKJ_9N0ib5SL9I9Ny7BpmyXLKUyyTzrwvTHK3MfYtEFqosNOVpK4Nfderdq72IINyHk4bl-dzefg

Editor and Reviewer Comments:

-

The paper evaluates the performance of three high resolution SPPEs over Bali island with direct measurements from high density of rain gauge stations at various elevations, rainfall intensities, and temporal scales. Considering the importance of the accurate temporal and spatial variability of global rainfall data, this evaluation work is crucial to improve the future applications of these SPPEs and is of high interest to the user community. The manuscript is well organized and provides comprehensive comparisons. I would recommend this manuscript to be published after minor revision by addressing the following issues:

1. The fifth paragraph in the Introduction should be shortened, because it does not have much relationship with this topic. Instead, you can add some introductions about the high density of rain gauge system over Bali island.
2. Better to explain why you choose the Bali island in the section of Introduction, like the sentences in line 340.
3. The rain gauges were divided to three elevation categories. However, the corresponding grid box of SPPEs product have larger spatial coverage and may spans across two elevation categories as shown in Figure 1. Please address how did you process the mismatch of the spatial coverage of rain gauge and SPPEs product and if it will bring uncertainties to the analysis.
4. It is better to add the label of categorical and volumetric indices in Figure 3.
5. Please add some sentences around line 474 to explain why you select the daily scale rather than the penta-day or monthly scale to do the evaluation at different elevations. Because as discussed before, the performance of three SPPEs is influenced by different time scales due to their temporal resolution limitations. This is more evident at daily scale. For example, the high temporal resolution of IMERG makes it show an overall better performance at daily scale. Therefore, the analysis based on daily scale at different elevations may not enough to draw the conclusion like in lines 482-484 and lines 565-566.

6. Line 559: you said point-to-grid-based, but before you said point-to-pixel-based, please make it consistent and I prefer the point-to-grid-based according to your Figure 1.

The manuscript entitled "Assessment of Satellite Precipitation Product Estimates over Bali Island" focus on assessing the performance of GSMaP, IMERG, and CHIRPS rain rate products over Bali Island from 2015 to 2017 using *in-situ* rain gauge data. A traditional point-to-pixel- based method along with a new introduced continuous, categorical, and volumetric statistical indices comparison approach were implemented to evaluate satellite rainfall products. The detailed results demonstrated that IMERG products achieved the highest performance. This work well compares satellite rainfall data, which is very important to the use of satellite rainfall data in the fields of climate and hydrology. However, there are still some questions need to be answered before publication.

Major suggestions:

1. Firstly, I think the three sentences of key points/highlights are too long and too tedious. You should shorten them.
2. Also, you should streamline your abstract. I think you should describe the key findings more clear, such as the good performance of IMERG.
3. Line 186, what are some technical breakdowns for other sites?
4. Usually we only discuss the accuracy and contingency table to validate rain rate.

What is the advantage of Volumetric Indices? Could you please further explain these kind of mathematical indices or introduce more advantages or merits of them.

5. Line 417. Why the CHIRPS performance on the monthly scale is promising and superior? Can you explain the reason behind this algorithm? You cited another two papers here to support your results? I think you should write down the specific number or conclusions from previous. Are they exactly the same?

6. Are there some bugs in your Tables 2 and 3? I see some no-alignments in these two tables.

7. Despite of that you have already added captions under figure2, could you please make wet and dry seasons results more clear in your figure2?

8. Line 505. Can you explain the possible reason for the decrease accuracy of performance of satellite rainfall data with elevation? I see the similar trend in three different dataset. I guess the possible reason can help the scientists to further improve their satellite rainfall product.

9. I think you should add mean absolute bias results in your figure 4. Maybe you can find more new information. From your current result, I find the GSMaP data show a better monthly mean ME and bias. Actually, I guess that it is due to the average treatment for negative and positive biases?